

BREVARD COUNTY

RECYCLING CITIZEN ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEETING

Date and Time: February 2, 2006 10:00 AM

Location: Brevard County Solid Waste Conference Room, 2725 Judge Fran Jamieson Way, Suite A118

Members Present: David Austin, Brian Blenis, Bette Danse, Bonnie DeCaro, Bill Nichols, Mike Shaffer, Pam Shoemaker, Amy Tidd, Roger Travis, Jennifer Wilster, Craig Yoder

Members Absent: Curtis Byrd, George Geletko, Georgia Phillips

Staff: Pam Shoemaker

Guests: Shauna Hume, City of Indian Harbour Beach, Tina Ramos, City of Rockledge Public Works, Erin LeClair, Brevard County Solid Waste, Ken Poole, City of Rockledge Public Works, Walter Parpart, Habitat for Humanity, Ted Dittenber, Habitat for Humanity Phil Danse

Minute Taker: Ede Luedke CPS

Quorum Present (X) Yes () No

Call to Order: Bette Danse called the meeting to order at 10:10 am. Ms. Danse called the roll.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Action *The committee discussed the approval of the November 3, 2005 minutes. Ms. Tidd moved to approve the minutes. Mr. Austin seconded the motion. All in favor, motion passed unanimously.*

Unfinished Business

Ms. Danse began the meeting by saying that today's meeting would be the last one of the year. The committee's report would be due in February. Ms. Shoemaker stated that the commission meeting would be February 21, 2006, and that the committee's report would need to be submitted with the agenda report by February 7, 2006. Bette referred everyone to the list of reports and the January 12, 2006, memo from the Board. She stated that the RCAC recommendations

were approved and the purpose of today's meeting is to go beyond this. Of course we can make more recommendations and there are a couple that we'll be discussing, like extending the sunset. Ms. Danse asked the committee to keep in mind, as they're going through the reports, that this is it, as far as new information that we'll be giving to the Board and that they want all the reports as updated as possible. Ms. Danse stated that the main thing about the report is cost analysis and cost effectiveness. She said she's seen on the computer what people are saying about the benefits of recycling all around the country. Some places are not doing curbside recycling because of the cost of collection. Ms. Danse stated that you can go to a transfer station and drop off your recycling, but curbside recycling is a costly venture for many places. Hawaii is finally going to a curbside recycling program. Residents pushed the government for a curbside recycling program and they got it. Ms. Shoemaker stated that the main problem for Hawaii is transportation costs of recyclables. Ms. Danse stated that the committee needs to appreciate Brevard County for its curbside collection and Pam and Erin who are current on everything going on in the recycling industry. Keep Brevard Beautiful and Habitat for Humanity have been helping the collection effort.

Ms. Shoemaker reported for Director Euri Rodriguez that there are 3,711 multi-family units in the unincorporated area of the county. The actual billing units are 14,000 but that breaks down into different places. Ms. Tidd asked for clarification on the definition of multi-family? Ms. Shoemaker stated that multi-family units are condos and apartment buildings. Ms. DeCaro asked if duplexes, triplexes and quads were included. Ms. Shoemaker stated that those are considered single-family units. Ms. Tidd asked Ms. Shoemaker if she had any estimates on how many of these multi-family units recycle. Ms. Shoemaker stated that Waste Management estimates that 25% of multi-family units participate.

Ms. Danse asked Ms. Shoemaker how the committee could encourage multi-families to recycle? Ms. Shoemaker spoke about a local condominium she had contacted that had no recycling in place. The property manager said that it would be up to the Homeowners Association to establish a recycling program. The property manager said it would require another person just to monitor the recycling bins. Ms. Shoemaker explained to some of the condo residents that they already pay for recycling service and it would not be an increase in collection or disposal costs for them. The residents are reporting the information at the next homeowners association meeting. Ms. Shoemaker explained that it's the property manager's decision whether to recycle or not. Their main complaints are they don't have the room and that the commodities get contaminated. You can't have contaminated recyclables because they aren't acceptable by the recyclers. If the homeowners associations want flyers, they can contact Ms. Shoemaker. She will provide flyers to educate residents about recycling. It is difficult to convince multi-families about recycling.

Ms. Danse referred to the report Mr. Rodriguez prepared about the economic value of recycling. She said there have been studies that have proven that most successful recycling is through curbside recycling. Brevard has curbside recycling and if we could take advantage of this with the multi-family units it would prove the economic value of recycling.

Mr. Rodriguez's report says that there is a cost to recycle materials that is partially offset by the income derived from the sale of the materials. Ms. Danse said we could get so much more recyclable materials if the multi-family units recycled. Ms. LeClair stated that some of them do recycle. Ms. Danse stated that it's a credit to their management.

Ms. Shoemaker stated that at the November 22nd Board meeting, the recommendations from this committee concerning 1) expanding the used beverage container recycling program to all major County facilities, 2) institute used beverage container recycling at all County parks that sell beverages, 3) send letters to all Brevard County municipalities requesting they institute beverage container recycling in their parks were tabled to the January 10, 2006 meeting at which time they were approved. The Commissioners directed staff to prepare a report on the economic value of recycling for the January meeting. Ms. Shoemaker stated that it costs approximately \$2,000,000 to pick up recycling. It costs approximately \$21.00 per year per unit, and there are 92,000 homes in the Brevard County unincorporated area. We received \$210,000 last year on the sale of recyclables. The saving of landfill space was estimated at \$28,992. Not many programs in the country make a lot of money, but it is not about money, it's about the environment. An article in the September 2005 issue of "Resource Recycling" by John H. Skinner, Ph.D., pointed out the savings of crude oil per commodity. Ms. Shoemaker distributed a chart on the Energy Consequences of Recycling in Brevard County and explained how each recycled material saved barrels of crude oil. In the unincorporated area of Brevard County, not including the municipalities, we recycled 9,438 tons of materials. We averted 35,851 barrels of crude oil for manufacture of new products. The futures market shows that crude oil is selling for \$60.00 a barrel. That is a \$2,000,000 + savings, just in Brevard County.

Ms. Shoemaker stated that staff and industry representatives briefed the commissioners. Ms. Shoemaker stated she heard Pam Swingle from EPA, speak on the energy savings of recycling. Nationwide we recycle about 36%. That saves the equivalent energy of taking 43,000,000 cars off the road. We have to sell the idea that we're saving oil and not concentrate on the financial gain of recycling. If you

figure that \$2,000,000 saved by Brevard County exponentially across the country you can see how much that would save. Ms. Tidd asked if payment to the haulers for garbage collection would increase if we didn't recycle because there would be more garbage to collect. Ms. Shoemaker said that we have unlimited garbage collection in the contract, so if the recyclables were put in the garbage, we couldn't charge the residents more for collection.

Mr. Yoder explained a pilot program with reverse vending machines with Coca-Cola, Wal-Mart, and Annheuser-Busch. The machines were placed at the Wal-Marts in Melbourne and Palm Bay. It's brand new technology where cans or plastic bottles are put in one at a time and the machine gives a receipt that could be taken to Wal-Mart for cash or merchandise. Mr. Yoder stated that the cans paid for themselves very easily but the plastics were losers. Coca-Cola didn't want to commit to it, but it's not a dead issue. He is still working on it. The largest recycling company in Europe made the reverse vending machines, but they didn't want to just sell the machines to us, they wanted part of the revenue from the machines. The program was receiving approximately 16,000 pounds of cans a month. Mr. Yoder stated that if we could have these machines in all seven of the Wal-Mart's in the county, it would really be good. He said it is not a dead issue and Ms. Shoemaker stated that it didn't impact the curbside recycling at all.

Discussion began on CDF issues and tipping fees. Ms. Danse asked Ms. Shoemaker if tipping fees were going to increase. Ms. Shoemaker stated that when you're a monopoly, tipping fees cannot be increased just because you want to make more money. Ms. Shoemaker stated that the collection fee and disposal fee increased this year. Ms. DeCaro stated that increasing tipping fees should be part of the committee's mission statement. Ms. Shoemaker stated that tipping fees are not a recycling issue but a solid waste issue.

Mr. Blenis reported that, based on the new hours and the availability of the drink machines for elementary schools, the School Board recommended that the schools recycle on a volunteer basis. He stated that half of the machines in elementary schools are for teachers. Mr. Blenis reported that, so far, no schools have exercised the option to replace bottled drinks with aluminum cans. The schools are recycling mixed paper and cardboard.

Ms. Shoemaker reported that the recycling collection area by the wall at the landfill cannot be moved immediately. She said that the wall area where waste is dumped by homeowners is old and is going to be relocated, but traffic flow issues need to be worked out before the recycling area is moved to that site.

New Business

Ms. Shoemaker stated that she and Mr. Dittenber, with Habitat, talked about recycling and the commodities in the county buildings. We started a “Can it” program and decided the one place that everybody goes to in public buildings is the restroom. So, there are recycling bins in all restrooms. Facilities collects the cans and Mr. and Mrs. Danse take them to the landfill. They sort them and put them in the proper containers. In order to expand this program, we need help with the sorting and transporting of the recyclables.

Ms. Shoemaker and Mr. Dittenber talked about Habitat collecting the cans. Mr. Gassman, President of Habitat said he cannot take co-mingled materials. They are not in the plastic business, and doesn't have volunteers to sort the materials. Habitat's main mission is building houses.

Habitat has some great volunteers like Ted Dittenber and Walter Parpart who oversee Habitat's can recycling. Habitat built a house with \$25,000 worth of recycled cans that Ted and Walter collected. Ms. Shoemaker stated that she's working with the County's Facilities Department to make recycling

work. It may not be worth the cost of gasoline for Habitat to drive to Titusville to collect cans collected there. Ms. Shoemaker stated that Titusville Courthouse is a major facility and needs to be part of the recycling program. Habitat has volunteers in the south end of the County, but not in the north end of the county. Mr. Dittenber stated that right now Habitat picks up at businesses, institutions and homes that are partners for collection sites. Wild Oats and Saint Mark's over on the beach side has a large shed where a large amount of cans are collected and that uses our time that we have to spend picking up recycling. Mr. Dittenber stated that it would be worthwhile to pick up at different locations if there was a large enough volume. They will pick up cans if the institutions or businesses have a place to store several bags of cans at a time. Mr. Austin asked if Habitat has dealt with the Florida Air Academy. Mr. Dittenber stated that they've had collection sites there but somebody has been taking the cans, because there hasn't been any there. They are having difficulty maintaining a secure site to store the recycled materials.

Mr. Austin stated that if Habitat could establish a couple of major pickups sites in Titusville, he would pick them up and bring them down to their facility on John Rhodes twice a month.

Mr. Dittenber stated that the sheds hold a full pick up truckload. It's a nasty job to take them out of the sheds and sort them. Ms. Shoemaker stated that she's skeptical about putting outside containers in Titusville because of her experience with the phone book recycling bins. People put trash in the phone book recycling containers so the phone books had to be thrown away. Ms. Shoemaker stated that she would have Habitat put a container at Mockingbird Way, but she's allowed Keep Brevard Beautiful to put a can igloo there. Mr. Dittenber asked if Habitat was imposing on Waste Management's curbside program. Ms. Shoemaker said no.

Mr. Dittenber stated that Manatee Elementary was interested in recycling their cans. He picks up recycling in Viera and ends in Palm Bay, on a weekly basis. If a resident fills up a box and calls him he will come and pick it up. Ms. Danse asked Mr. Dittenber if he was in charge of the scheduling of the pickups. Mr. Dittenber said yes.

Ms. Tidd asked if there could be a policy stating that anyone using county facilities, i.e. fairs, festivals, be required to recycle beverage containers that were drunk at the facilities. Ms. Danse asked if the commissioners could make a recommendation. Ms. Shoemaker stated that the most effective way to approach the situation was for Mr. Dittenber to contact the Parks and Recreation Department Director directly. She said we don't know what Parks and Recreation's policies are. Ms. Shoemaker stated that they have been directed by the Board to recycle at their facilities. Ms. Danse said that even putting one or two containers in a park would be a little step in the right direction. Ms. Shoemaker stated that she wants to expand the recycling to Titusville, the Melbourne Courthouse, and the Sarno Complex. We may have to limit the collection to aluminum cans, but then it becomes counter-productive because we may not collect as much aluminum. Solid Waste doesn't have the manpower to sort commingled recyclables, Facilities doesn't have the manpower, and to use prisoners would involve supervision, so it gets really complicated.

Mr. Dittenber requested a copy of the minutes from today's meeting.

Ms. Danse stated that Mr. Dittenber also recycles ink jet and laser jet cartridges. He will pick them up or they can be dropped off at one of the Habitat offices.

Ms. Danse asked Ms. Shoemaker if she had any responses from the cities. Ms. Shoemaker said she had one response.

Ms. Shoemaker presented an updated report about the libraries. She stated that an e-mail was sent to all of the libraries asking how the recycling containers were working out. The South Mainland library said their magazine bin is emptied regularly; Central library said they had no problems; Suntree Viera said their recycling was very successful; DeGroot said their program is doing well and that when they call to get a pickup, it is picked up promptly; and, Merritt Island Library said they have a lot of magazines donated to them and said those left are recycled.

Ms. Shoemaker contacted Steve Stultz Purchasing Director and asked if they tracked purchases of environmentally preferred products. Mr. Stultz stated that the Board did not direct him to track such purchases.

Ms. Shoemaker received a letter from the Space Coast League of Cities stating that it was the consensus of the Board to endorse the concept of volunteer participation of businesses in recycling.

Ms. Danse commented on the January 12, 2006 memo from the Clerk to the Board that they've come a long way from when the committee first started. Ms. Tidd stated that when the committee began students could only recycle at their homes, now they have an opportunity to recycle at school, at the parks, at public buildings, so it becomes a pattern in their lives.

Ms. Danse commented on the January 10, 2006 letter sent to the City of Cape Canaveral by the Board. She asked if this type of letter could be sent to the multi-family residences. Ms. DeCaro stated that the letter should say that the county is mandated by the state to have a recycling program and that we would like to have your (the cities') contribution and your participation in this program. Ms. Shoemaker stated

that unless you show these residences and cities where it's going to save them in their pocketbook, you're not going to persuade them. Ms. DeCaro stated that the letter should contain a paragraph on the economic value of recycling. Ms. Shoemaker stated that unless they see a reduction in their bill, it comes down to them having to hire someone to monitor the recycling containers, which is costing them money. Mr. Yoder stated that it's not really the economic side of recycling for most small businesses, but the space needed to recycle; he said the bottom line is square footage.

Ms. Tidd stated that since the committee doesn't have a letter prepared for the Board, it should be tabled until the sunset is extended.

There was discussion as to whether there was some kind of property management association group where someone could speak to them regarding the recycling program instead of writing a letter. Mr. Yoder stated that we have to be careful with the length of a letter. Businesses only have a small amount of time during the day to read their mail, so it needs to be short. Ms. Shoemaker stated that if the committee could find which groups to talk to, she thought it would be better to talk to them one on one. Ms. Shoemaker asked Ms. DeCaro for help researching the property management associations. Ms. Danse stated that meeting with the associations should be step two. Step one should be approval from the Board for a letter from the Board requesting that multi-families recycle.

Ms. Shoemaker stated that the committee doesn't need permission from the Board to send a letter from the Solid Waste Department. She said she just needs a list of addresses and contacts to send the letter to.

Action

Ms. Tidd motioned to table writing of the letter to multi-families until after the Sunset. Seconded by Mr. Austin. All in favor, passed unanimously.

Ms. Danse asked Mr. Travis for his recycling report. Mr. Yoder presented his report by referring the committee to the drop in the recycling numbers. He stated that if an uneducated person (as far as recycling) saw a drop, they wouldn't understand why it's gone down. He said, for one thing, the volume of newspapers has gone down due to electronic media and the Internet. Glass has also gone down because more things are being made from plastic.

Brevard County's unadjusted recycling rate for 2004 was 41%. That is 41% municipal solid waste was diverted from the landfill. The adjusted recycling rate is 30%, so we have met the state goal and far exceeded it with our unadjusted recycling rate.

Ms. Shoemaker presented a report from George Geletko of Waste Management. She stated that Mr. Geletko has contracted with the "New Home Buyers Guide" for an advertisement that contains pertinent phone numbers for garbage collection and solid waste information, including collection rules and recycling information. Waste Management is paying for this information and they are also carrying a heavy inventory of recycling bins. Ms. DeCaro asked if this "New Home Buyers Guide" would only be distributed to people building new homes. Ms. Shoemaker said it was for all new homeowners buying old and newly constructed homes and that the Guide would be in their closing packages. One hundred thousand guides will be published.

Waste Management is instituting a pilot program beachside for the automated cart system. Each resident will have the choice of a 64 or 96-gallon rollable garbage bin. Mr. Shaffer asked how to handle items that won't fit in the bin. Ms. Shoemaker stated that everything going into the garbage must fit in the bin; anything, i.e. large yard waste piles must be scheduled for pickup by the clamshell truck. Waste Management will be doing a mailing to all

homeowners in the area about the pilot program and will include recycling information.

Discussion

Discussion was held on the final report to the commissioners. Ms. Shoemaker stated that there are four (4) motions that need to go into the final report, the first motion we asked the commissioners to write a letter encouraging businesses to increase their recycling; the second motion was for the commissioners to write a letter encouraging the cities to encourage their local businesses to recycle; the third was to extend the sunset of the RCAC for an additional year; and, the fourth was to inactivate the volunteer speakers bureau.

Ms. DeCaro referred to the previous meeting minutes regarding Waste Management's delivery of recycle bins. The discussion was whether Waste Management could be required to deliver bins within two weeks of a request. Ms. Shoemaker stated that it would involve a change in the contract language. The committee could recommend that in the next contract negotiation that wording be put in the contract requiring bins be delivered within two weeks of a request. Mr. Yoder asked what the contract states as far as delivery of recycle bins.

Ms. Shoemaker stated that it states, "in a timely fashion." She also stated that there are provisions in the contract to financially fine Waste Management if a request is outstanding too long. Ms. DeCaro asked what the definition of "in a timely manner" was and what is a fine based on? Ms. Shoemaker stated that the fines are based on complaints for non-delivery of bins. Ms. Shoemaker stated that one of the homeowners' lists that was not done in a timely fashion resulted in a 50% fine to Waste Management, so that it cost them approximately \$900.00.

Public Comments

Ms. Hume commented about the reason why multi-family and condo units don't want to recycle, because they can't police the recycling containers.

Next Meeting

The next scheduled meeting will be held Thursday, May 11, 2006 at 10:00 a.m. in the Solid Waste Management Conference Room.

Adjourn

The meeting adjourned at 12:15 p.m.

Bette Danse
Chairperson

Ede Luedke CPS
RCAC Minute Taker

Minutes Approved